EDUCATION AND EXAMINATION COMMITTEE

OF THE

SOCIETY OF ACTUARIES

DESIGN AND PRICING—(DP) RETIREMENT BENEFITS STUDY NOTE

RETIREMENT BENEFITS CASE STUDY-CANADA

REVISED IN 2007

This case study will be used as a basis for examination questions. Be sure to answer the question asked by referring to the case study. For example, when asked for advantages of a particular plan design to the company referenced in the case study, your response should be limited to that company. Other advantages should not be listed, as they are extraneous to the question and will result in no additional credit. Further, if they conflict with the applicable advantages, no credit will be given.

Copyright 2007 by the Society of Actuaries

The Education and Examination Committee provides study notes to persons preparing for the examinations of the Society of Actuaries. They are intended to acquaint candidates with some of the theoretical and practical considerations involved in the various subjects. While varying opinions are presented where appropriate, limits on the length of the material and other considerations sometimes prevent the inclusion of all possible opinions. These study notes do not, however, represent any official opinion, interpretations or endorsement of the Society of Actuaries or its Education and Examination Committee. The Society is grateful to the authors for their contributions in preparing the study notes.

RC-D13-07 Printed in the USA

•			
			:
			; •
			· !
			· •
	•	-	
	•		

Case Study - Course DP Retirement-CANADA

National Oil Company - Background

National Oil Company (NOC) is a large well-established company that services oil wells all over Canada. Most of NOC's employees are employed in the province of Ontario. NOC has been in existence for over 30 years and has more than 10,000 full-time salaried and union hourly employees and over 6,000 part-time employees. The full-time workforce is reasonably stable, but turnover in the last 5 years has been greater than desired, due to competitors recruiting NOC's employees.

Normally, an undergraduate degree is a minimum requirement to obtain entry to the salaried workforce and many employees have graduate degrees. About half of NOC's salaried employees are recruited directly from university with the other half coming from competitors.

The company's financial position varies with the price of oil. As oil prices rise, oil companies become increasingly active and in turn require the services of NOC. Conversely, activity slows as oil prices drop Despite this, the company is usually in a taxable position.

NOC has managed to be successful by staying on the cutting edge of technology. NOC prides itself in being state of the art in processes and software relevant to its industry. This has helped it to stave off competition from both inside and outside of Canada. Although NOC is the largest player in the industry within Canada, there are larger players from outside of the country, with which NOC has to compete. From time to time, there are rumors of a takeover of NOC.

Canadian legislation and social programs will apply to NOC in this case study.

Summary of National Oil's Retirement Benefits

NOC maintains three defined benefit plans:

- a final-average pay defined benefit (DB) RPP for its full-time salaried employees;
- a flat dollar DB RPP for its full-time hourly union staff;
- a dc plan for its part-time workforce; and
- 4. a non-eligible pension plan (referred to as the SERP) for its executives that is supplemental to the salaried RPP. This plan has no assets.

Extracts of Retirement Benefits Provisions and Financial Information

National Oil Full-Time Salaried Pension Plan

Eligibility

Immediate

Vesting

100% after 2 years of plan membership

Normal Retirement Age

65

Early Retirement Age

55 with 2 years of plan membership

Best Average Earnings

Average annual earnings during 60 consecutive months in

which earnings were highest

Earnings

Basic pay, excluding overtime and bonuses

Normal Retirement Benefit

2% of best average earnings times years of service,

subject to tax system maximum

Accrued Benefit

Benefit calculated as under the normal retirement benefit

formula using best average earnings and service as of

date of calculation

Early Retirement Benefit

Accrued benefit reduced by 0.25% per month that early

retirement precedes age 62

Form of Benefit

If married, 60% joint & survivor benefit, without reduction.

If not married, single life annuity

Optional Forms of Benefit

None

Indexing

None

Termination Benefit

Lump sum equal to actuarial present value of accrued

benefit

Pre-Retirement Death Benefit

Lump sum equal to actuarial present value of accrued

benefit payable to named beneficiary

Disability Benefit

Accrual of service while on long term disability

National Oil Full-Time Salaried Pension Plan

Historical Actuarial Valuation Results

	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007
Participant Summary - January 1					
Active Participants			***		
(a) count	4,243	4,293	4,305	4,268	4,286
(b) average age	44 9	44 7	45 6	45.6	45.5
(c) average service	15 6	15 5	15 5	15 2	15.4
(d) average future working lifetime	11.3	11.7	11.0	11.0	11.0
(e) average plan earnings (prior year)	64 000	65 000	67,000	67 200	67 300
Deferred Vested Participants					
(a) count	-	-	•	-	
Pensioners (incl beneficiaries)	0				
(a) count	590	612	640	665	695
(b) average age	70.8	70.7	70.8	70.9	69.8
(c) average annual benefit	19,100	19,300	19,500	19,700	20,100

Plan Assets (numbers in \$000's) *

			<u> </u>		
Change in Plan Assets during Prior Year:		000	074.004	779.690	860 847
Market Value of Assets at January 1 of prior year	545.745	529,366	674,861	772 639	000 047
Employer Contributions during prior year	31,532	40,145	37 000	39,789	(00.500)
Benefit Payments during prior year	(14 660)	(15,110)	(19,480)	(20 500)	(20.500)
Expenses during prior year	-	-	-	-	. .
Investment return during prior year	(33,251)	120,461	80,257	68,919	119,084
Market Value of Assets at January 1 of current year	529,366	674 861	772,639	860,847	959,430
Rate of return during prior year	-6%	22%	12%	9%	14%
Average Portfolio Mix During Prior Year.					
(a) Domestic Large Cap Equities	27%	30%	30%	29%	30%
(b) Domestic Small Cap Equities	24%	30%	27%	28%	27%
(c) Domestic Fixed Income	34%	25%	26%	27%	27%
(d) International Equities	8%	11%	13%	11%	11%
(e) Real Estate	3%	2%	2%	3%	3%
(f) Cash	<u>4%</u>	2%	<u>2%</u>	<u>2%</u>	<u>2%</u>
(g) Total	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Asset Class Returns during Prior Year					
(a) Domestic Large Cap Equities	-14%	25%	15%	13%	23%
(b) Domestic Small Cap Equities	-18%	30%	14%	7%	18%
(c) Domestic Fixed Income	9%	5%	7%	3%	4%
(d) International Equities	-16%	40%	12%	17%	10%
(e) Real Estate	4%	3%	3%	12%	8%
(f) Cash	2%	1%	1%	2%	2%

^{*} numbers may not add due to rounding

National Oil Full-Time Salaried Pension Plan

Historical Actuarial Valuation Results

2006 2007 2003 2004 2005 Funding Valuation - January 1 (numbers in \$000's) * 1. Actuarial Accrued Liability: 643 703 570 617 616 733 633.605 502,139 (a) Active participants (b) Deferred vested participants 143,886 134,935 106,304 114,442 98,040 (c) Pensioners 768,540 787,589 731,175 676 921 600 179 (d) Total 959 430 772 639 860 847 2 Actuarial Value of Assets 529,366 674 861 (92,306)(171841)2,060 (41464)3. Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability (1d)-(2) 70 813 41,799 41 685 39,789 32,188 36 814 4 Normal Cost (beg. Of year) 5. Change in Unfunded AAL during prior year: 2.060 (41.464) $(92\ 306)$ (a) Unfunded AAL at prior valuation date 7,275 70,813 (6000)5 665 144 (2799)582 (b) Adjustment for Interest 1 096 1,343 44 394 (c) Normal Cost w/interest less contributions 382 (6.987)(63795)(77,110)(32,404)(16, 115)77 585 (d) (Gain)/Loss on investment (15,400) (14 000)(e) (Gain)/Loss on termination (8.100)(2,200)(2100)(23,700)(25,000)(13800)(f) (Gain)/Loss on salary increases less than expected (12 800)(19,700)(6,800)(6,800)(1,400)(4.000)200 (g) (Gain)/Loss on mortality (7,400)(8500)(4700)(h) (Gain)/Loss on retirement (1200)(2,800)20,000 36,500 19 100 (i) (Gain)/Loss on assumption changes (j) (Gain)/Loss on expenses 28 166 988 (821)(860)(k) (Gain)/Loss on all other factors (171,841) (92,306) (41 464) (I) Unfunded AAL at current valuation date 70 813 2,060 6 Actuarial Basis 6 50% 6 50% 7 00% 6 75% 8.00% (a) Interest 3.50% 3.50% 3 75% 5.00% 4.00% (b) Salary scale 3 00% 3.50% 3 00% 3.00% 3.50% (c) Consumer Price Index GAM83 (d) Mortality Based on NOC experience for 1986-1988 (e) Turnover Age 62 (f) Retirement age 80% married male spouse 3 years older than female spouse (g) Proportion married and age difference (h) Expenses Assume all expenses paid by company (i) Asset Valuation Method Market value of assets (j) Actuarial Cost Method Projected unit credit

^{*} numbers may not add due to rounding

National Oil Full-Time Salaried Pension Plan Reconciliation of Plan Participants (2003 - 2006)

	Active	Pensioners/ Beneficiaries	Total
1. Participants as of January 1, 2003	4,243	590	4,833
- New Entrants/Rehires	375	-	375
- Terminated Nonvested	(120)	-	(120)
 Terminated Vested (Lump Sum Cashout) 	(175)	-	(175)
- Retirement	(28)	28	-
 Death w/ Beneficiary 	(2)	2	- (0)
 Death w/o Beneficiary 	-	(8)	(8)
- Net change	50	22	72
2. Participants as of January 1, 2004	4,293	612	4,905
- New Entrants/Rehires	400	-	400
- Terminated Nonvested	(150)	-	(150)
- Terminated Vested (Lump Sum Cashout)	(200)	-	(200)
- Retirement	(35)	35	=
- Death w/ Beneficiary	(3)	3	-
- Death w/o Beneficiary	-	(10)	(10)
- Net change	12	28	40
3. Participants as of January 1, 2005	4,305	640	4,945
- New Entrants/Rehires	250	-	250
- Terminated Nonvested	(115)	-	(115)
- Terminated Vested (Lump Sum Cashout)	(140)	-	(140)
- Retirement	(30)	30	-
- Death w/ Beneficiary	(2)	2	
 Death w/o Beneficiary 	<u>.</u>	(7)	(7)
- Net change	(37)	25	(12)
4. Participants as of January 1, 2006	4,268	665	4,933
- New Entrants/Rehires	300	-	300
- Terminated Nonvested	(130)	-	(130)
 Terminated Vested (Lump Sum Cashout) 	(115)	-	(115)
- Retirement	(35)	35	-
- Death w/ Beneficiary	(2)	2	- -
- Death w/o Beneficiary	-	(7)	(7)
- Net change	18	30	48
5. Participants as of January 1, 2007	4,286	695	4,981

National Oil Full-Time Salaried Pension Plan Age/Svc/Earnings as of January 1, 2007

Age (Years)

Totais	290 40,800	515 55,300	1,001	1,607	844 70,000	29 50,700	4,286 67,300	
>20	1 1	t 1	201 77,800	755 77,800	431 74,200	4 53,900	1,391 76,600	
15-20	r 1	55 65,100	211 76,300	310 75,600	81 73,900	9 27,600	663 74,600	
Service (Years) 10-15	1 1	100	186 70,200	195 67,500	87	10 46,200	578 67,100	
% 5-10	140 46,100	160 58,000	208 66,300	163 65,200	77 64,100	5 52,100	753 60,200	
ស V	150 35,900	200	195 59,400	184 62,600	168 61.200	4,000	901	45.5 15.4 67.300
	# Participants Average Salary	Avg Age Avg Svc Avg Salary						
	< 25	25-35	35-45	45-55	55-65	> 65	Totals	

National Oil Full-Time Salaried Supplemental Executive Retirement Plan (SERP)

Eligibility

Immediate

Normal Retirement Age

65

Early Retirement Age

55 with 2 years of plan membership

Accrued Benefit

Accrued Benefit calculated under the provisions of the Salaried Pension Plan without regard to tax system maximums <u>less</u> actual Accrued Benefit under the

Salaried Pension Plan

Normal Retirement Benefit

Accrued Benefit

Early Retirement Benefit

Accrued Benefit reduced by 0.25% per month that

early retirement precedes age 62

Commencement Date and Form

of Benefit

Must be same as under Salaried Pension Plan

Indexing

None

Termination Benefit

None

Pre-Retirement Death Benefit

None

Disability Benefit

None

Supplemental Retirement Plan <u>Historical Valuation Results - January 1</u>	2004	2005	2006	2007
Participant Summary		•		
1 Active Participants				
(a) count	45	47	49	52
(b) average age	52.4	52 9	53.1	53.1
(c) average service	17 5	18 1	18.2	18 2
(d) average future working lifetime	7 0	6.5	63	6.3
(e) average earnings (prior year)	305,000	310,000	315,000	325,000
2 Deferred Vested Participants				
(a) count	-	-	-	-

15

70.4

13,100

14

696

12,900

13

69.0

12,500

17

70.1

14,000

Valuation Results (numbers in \$000's) *

3 Pensioners (incl beneficiaries)

(c) average annual benefit

(a) count

(b) average age

(0.7.000)	(00.040)	(22.702)	(40.444)
(25,036)	(28,813)	(33,762)	(42,444)
(25,036)	(28,813)	(33,762)	(42,444)
, ,			4.040
911	992	1,074	1,340
163	181	197	238
6.25%	6 00%	5.50%	5.00%
4.00%	3 75%	3.50%	3.50%
3 50%	3 00%	3.00%	3.00%
	6.25% 4.00%	(25,036) (28,813) 911 992 163 181 6 25% 6 00% 4 00% 3 75%	(25,036) (28,813) (33,762) 911 992 1,074 163 181 197 6 25% 6 00% 5 50% 4 00% 3 75% 3 50%

^{*} numbers may not add due to rounding

National Oil Full-Time Hourly Union Pension Plan

Eligibility

Immediate

Vesting

100% after 2 years of plan membership

Normal Retirement Age

65

Early Retirement Age

55 with 10 years of service

Normal Retirement Benefit

\$75 per month times years of service for terminations/

retirements during 2003, 2004, and 2005

\$80 per month times years of service for terminations/

retirements during 2006 and beyond

Accrued Benefit

Benefit calculated as under the normal retirement benefit formula based on service and multiplier as of date of

calculation.

Early Retirement Benefit

Unreduced benefit at 62 with 30 years of service, otherwise reduced by 0.25% per month that early retirement precedes Normal Retirement Age.

Form of Benefit

With a spouse, 60% joint & survivor benefit without reduction

Without a spouse, single life annuity

Optional Forms of Benefit

None

Post-Retirement Indexing

Lesser of 1% or CPI each year after pension commencement

Termination Benefit

Lump sum equal to actuarial present value of accrued

benefit assuming no indexing

Pre-Retirement Death Benefit

Lump sum equal to actuarial present value of accrued benefit assuming no indexing, payable to named beneficiary

Disability Benefit

None

National Oil Full-Time Hourly Union Pension Plan Historical Actuarial Valuation Results

	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007
Participant Summary - January 1					
Active Participants			0.005	6 253	6 321
(a) count	6,437	6,376	6,295 46.4	46 5	46 3
(b) average age	45.1	45.5 46.7	17.3	17 4	17 2
(c) average service	16.2	16 7	10.7	10.6	10.8
(d) average future working lifetime	11.8	11.5	39,500	39,800	39 600
(e) average plan earnings (prior year)	37,100	38,032	39,500	39,000	00 000
Deferred Vested Participants					
(a) count	· -	-	•	-	-
Pensioners (incl beneficiaries)		-			4.004
(a) count	985	1,016	1,034	1,060	1,081
(b) average age	71.0	71.5	72.3	72.8	71.8
(c) average annual benefit	9,800	9,900	10,000	10,800	11,200

Plan Assets (numbers in \$000's) *

Change in Plan Assets during Prior Year	000.040	200 022	380,679	444,857	504 928
Market Value of Assets at January 1 of prior year	306,848	306,622	•	34,400	42,000
Employer Contributions during prior year	19,000	24,000	33,000	,	(15,000)
Benefit Payments during prior year	(9,883)	(11,258)	(11,340)	(12,000)	(15,000)
Expenses during prior year	-	. .	-	07.070	70 700
Investment return during prior year	(9,342)	61,315	42,518	37,670	73,720
Market Value of Assets at January 1 of current year	306 622	380,679	444,857	504 928	605 648
Rate of return during prior year	-3%	20%	11%	8%	14%
Average Portfolio Mix During Prior Year					001/
(a) Domestic Large Cap Equities	21%	25%	29%	30%	30%
(b) Domestic Small Cap Equities	23%	25%	20%	21%	27%
(c) Domestic Fixed Income	47%	35%	38%	36%	27%
(d) International Equities	2%	10%	8%	9%	11%
(e) Real Estate	2%	2%	2%	2%	3%
(f) Cash	5%	<u>3%</u>	<u>3%</u>	<u>2%</u>	2%
(g) Total	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Asset Class Returns during Prior Year:				400/	030/
(a) Domestic Large Cap Equities	-14%	25%	15%	13%	23%
(b) Domestic Small Cap Equities	-18%	30%	14%	7%	18%
(c) Domestic Fixed Income	9%	5%	7%	3%	4%
(d) International Equities	-16%	40%	12%	17%	10%
(e) Real Estate	4%	3%	3%	12%	8%
(f) Cash	2%	1%	1%	2%	2%

^{*} numbers may not add due to rounding

National Oil Full-Time Hourly Union Pension Plan Historical Actuarial Valuation Results

Funding Valuation - January 1 (numbers in \$000's) *

1 Actuarial Accrued Liability:	•	75	\$	75	¢	75	\$	80	\$	80
Active Multiplier	\$	281,619	Φ	376,579	φ	435 162	Ψ	507.668	•	48,941
(a) Active participants		201,019		570,579		-00 TOE		-	·	-
(b) Deferred vested participants		91,704		96,561		98,230		117,914	1:	24,704
(c) Pensioners	-	373,323		473,140		533 392		625 582		73 645
(d) Total		010,020		17,0,710		555 552		•-•		
2 Actuarial Value of Assets		306 622		380 679		444,857		504,928	6	05 648
3 Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability (1d)-(2)		66 701		92,460		88,534		120,655	1	67 997
4 Normal Cost (beg Of year)		17,384		22,550		25 154		29,176		31 915
5. Change in Unfunded AAL during prior year.										
(a) Unfunded AAL at prior valuation date		32,959		66,701		92,460		88 534	1	20 655
(b) Adjustment for Interest		2,637		5,336		6,472		5,976	_	7 843
(c) Normal Cost w/interest less contributions		(2,389)		(6,185)		(10 027)		(8,709)		12,292
(d) (Gain)/Loss on investment		34,255		(36,276)		(15 112)		(6,886)	(40,023
(e) (Gain)/Loss on termination		(1,500)		(8.000)		(6 700)		(10,400)		(6 000
(f) (Gain)/Loss on salary increases less than expected		-		-		-		-		-
(g) (Gain)/Loss on mortality		200		(1,000)		(1,200)		(1,900)		(1,900
(h) (Gain)/Loss on retirement		(250)		(500)		(750)		(550)		(400
(i) (Gain)/Loss on assumption changes		- '		73,000		24 200		23,400		-
(i) (Gain)/Loss on expenses		-		-				-		-
(k) (Gain)/Loss on all other factors		789		(615)		(809)		(539)		114
(I) Change in active benefit multiplier		-		`- ′		•		31,729		-
(m) Unfunded AAL at current valuation date		66 701		92,460		88 534		120,655		67 997
6 Actuarial Basis										
(a) Interest		8 00%		7.00%		6 75%		6 50%		6 50%
(b) Salary scale		N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A
(c) Consumer Price Index		3 50%		3.50%		3 00%		3 00%		3 00%
(d) Mortality					(SAM83				
(e) Turnover				Based on NO	OC ex	operience for	1986	6-1988		
(f) Retirement age		Ααe	62.	with appropr	riate e	early retirem	ent re	eduction, if a	ny	
(g) Proportion married and age difference		80% n	iarrie	d, male spo	uses	3 years olde	r thai	n female spo	ouses	
(h) Expenses						nses paid by				
(i) Post-retirement indexing		1 00%		1 00%		1.00%		1 00%		1 00%
(i) Asset Valuation Method		. 5070				alue of asse	ets			
(i) Asset valuation wethod (k) Actuarial Cost Method				1410		nit credit	-			

^{*} numbers may not add due to rounding

National Oil Full-Time Hourly Union Pension Plan Reconciliation of Plan Participants (2003 - 2006)

	Active	Pensioners/ Beneficiaries	Total
1. Participants as of January 1, 2003	6,437	985	7,422
- New Entrants/Rehires	200	-	200
- Terminated Nonvested	(100)	÷.	(100)
- Terminated Vested (Lump Sum Cashout)	(120)		(120)
- Retirement	(40)	40	-
- Death w/ Beneficiary	(1)	1	_
- Death w/o Beneficiary	-	(10)	(10)
- Net change	(61)	31	(30)
2. Participants as of January 1, 2004	6,376	1,016	7,392
- New Entrants/Rehires	120	-	120
- Terminated Nonvested	(75)	-	(75)
- Terminated Vested (Lump Sum Cashout)	(100)	-	(100)
- Retirement	(25)	25	-
- Death w/ Beneficiary	(1)	1	-
- Death w/o Beneficiary	-	(8)	(8)
- Net change	(81)	18	(63)
3. Participants as of January 1, 2005	6,295	1,034	7,329
- New Entrants/Rehires	150	-	150
- Terminated Nonvested	(80)	-	(80)
 Terminated Vested (Lump Sum Cashout) 	(75)	-	(75)
- Retirement	(35)	35	-
- Death w/ Beneficiary	(2)	2	- (4.4)
- Death w/o Beneficiary	-	(11)	(11)
- Net change	(42)	26	(16)
4. Participants as of January 1, 2006	6,253	1,060	7,313
- New Entrants/Rehires	170	-	170
- Terminated Nonvested	(30)	-	(30)
- Terminated Vested (Lump Sum Cashout)	(40)	-	(40)
- Retirement	(30)	30	-
- Death w/ Beneficiary	(2)	2	-
- Death w/o Beneficiary	-	(11)	(11)
- Net change	68	21	89
5. Participants as of January 1, 2007	6,321	1,081	7,402

National Oil Full-Time Hourly Union Pension Plan Age/Svc/Earnings as of January 1, 2007

Age (Years)

		۸ 5	S	Service (Years) 10-15	15-20	>20	Totals
# Participants Average Salary	>	200 25,500	90 31,300	1 I	1 1	1 1	290 27,300
# Participants Average Salary	>	270 26,800	120 31,800	91 37,800	62 38,300	1 1	543 31,100
# Participants Average Salary	ے ی	275 27,000	350 32,200	320 39,400	659 44,300	441 46,600	2,045 39,600
# Participants Average Salary	ے ی	120 25,000	160 32,200	300	688 43,000	895 46,800	2,163 42,200
# Participants Average Salary	s: Si	95 24,500	62 28,700	94 36,400	186 39,900	801 46,400	1,238 42,100
# Participants Average Salary	ıts any	8 20,600	9 21,600	11 25,700	8 24,600	6 25,100	42 23,600
# Participants Average Salary	ıts ary	968 26,100	791 31,600	816 38,400	1,603 42,900	2,143 46,500	6,321
Avg Age Avg Svc Avg Salary		46.3 17.2 39.600					

National Oil Part-Time DC Pension Plan

Eligibility

Immediate

Vesting

Immediate

Employer Contributions

50% match of employee contributions

Employee Contributions

3% of base pay

Plan Fund

The employer invests the contributions in a balanced fund. There are no employee investment choices.

Account Balance

Contributions are accumulated in member's individual account earning investment income at the rate of return

earned by the Plan Fund.

Loans

Not permitted.

Benefit on Termination or

Retirement

Account balance is transferred to a LIRA/LIF for the member after one year from date of termination or retirement, unless employee has since returned to

employment with NOC.

Benefit on Death

Account balance is payable to named beneficiary

National Oil Part-Time DC Pension Plan

Historical Results - January 1

	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007
Participant Summary					
(a) number participating during prior year (b) average age (c) average base pay	5,900 29.5 22,000 00	6,200 30.0 23,000 00	6,300 30.5 24,000 00	6,250 30.9 26,000 00	6,500 28.9 29,000 00

Plan Assets (numbers in \$000's) *

Change in Plan Assets during Prior Year.		44 700	40 700	C7 074	67 770
Market Value of Assets at January 1 of prior year	40,000	41,739	46,792	57 871	67,779
Employee Contributions during prior year	3,894	4 278	4,536	4,875	5,65
Company Contributions during prior year	1,947	2,139	2,268	2,438	2,828
Benefit Payments during prior year	(5,310)	(5,580)	(5,670)	(5,625)	(5,850
Expenses during prior year	=	-	•	. -	-
nvestment return during prior year	1,208	4,216	9,945	8,220	4,837
Market Value of Assets at January 1 of current year	41,739	46,792	57,871	67 779	75,248
Rate of return during prior year	3%	10%	21%	14%	79

^{*} numbers may not add due to rounding